

313(8): Checking and Clarifying Note 313(6)

From Eq. (14) onwards:

$$\begin{aligned}
 [D_\rho, [D_\mu, D_\nu]] V^\kappa &= D_\rho ([D_\mu, D_\nu] V^\kappa) - [D_\mu, D_\nu] D_\rho V^\kappa \quad - (1) \\
 &= D_\rho (R^\kappa_{\lambda\mu\nu} V^\lambda - T^\lambda_{\mu\nu} D_\lambda V^\kappa) \\
 &\quad - R^\kappa_{\lambda\mu\nu} D_\rho V^\lambda + R^\lambda_{\rho\mu\nu} D_\lambda V^\kappa + T^\lambda_{\mu\nu} D_\lambda D_\rho V^\kappa \\
 &= D_\rho R^\kappa_{\lambda\mu\nu} V^\lambda + R^\kappa_{\lambda\mu\nu} D_\rho V^\lambda \\
 &\quad - D_\rho T^\lambda_{\mu\nu} D_\lambda V^\kappa - T^\lambda_{\mu\nu} D_\rho D_\lambda V^\kappa \\
 &\quad - R^\kappa_{\lambda\mu\nu} D_\rho V^\lambda + R^\lambda_{\rho\mu\nu} D_\lambda V^\kappa + T^\lambda_{\mu\nu} D_\lambda D_\rho V^\kappa \\
 &= D_\rho R^\kappa_{\lambda\mu\nu} V^\lambda - D_\rho T^\lambda_{\mu\nu} D_\lambda V^\kappa + R^\lambda_{\rho\mu\nu} D_\lambda V^\kappa \\
 &\quad - T^\lambda_{\mu\nu} [D_\rho, D_\lambda] V^\kappa
 \end{aligned}$$

The complete Jacobi identity is therefore:

$$\begin{aligned}
 ([D_\rho, [D_\mu, D_\nu]] + [D_\nu, [D_\rho, D_\mu]] + [D_\mu, [D_\nu, D_\rho]]) V^\kappa \\
 = (D_\rho R^\kappa_{\lambda\mu\nu} + D_\nu R^\kappa_{\lambda\rho\mu} + D_\mu R^\kappa_{\lambda\nu\rho}) V^\lambda
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 & 2) \\
 & + (R_{\rho\mu\nu}^{\lambda} + R_{\nu\rho\mu}^{\lambda} + R_{\mu\nu\rho}^{\lambda} - (D_{\rho} T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} + D_{\nu} T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} + D_{\mu} T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda})) D_{\lambda} V^{\kappa} \\
 & - (T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} [D_{\rho}, D_{\lambda}] + T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} [D_{\nu}, D_{\lambda}] + T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda} [D_{\mu}, D_{\lambda}]) V^{\kappa} \\
 & \quad \quad \quad = 0 \quad \quad \quad - (2)
 \end{aligned}$$

Now use the Cartan identity:

$$D_{\rho} T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} + D_{\nu} T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} + D_{\mu} T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda} := R_{\rho\mu\nu}^{\lambda} + R_{\nu\rho\mu}^{\lambda} + R_{\mu\nu\rho}^{\lambda} \quad - (3)$$

And we can prove a 2nd identity:

The Jacobi Cartan Evans (JCE) identity is:

$$\begin{aligned}
 & ([D_{\rho}, [D_{\mu}, D_{\nu}]] + [D_{\nu}, [D_{\rho}, D_{\mu}]] + [D_{\mu}, [D_{\nu}, D_{\rho}]]) V^{\kappa} \\
 & := (T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} [D_{\rho}, D_{\lambda}] + T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} [D_{\nu}, D_{\lambda}] + T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda} [D_{\mu}, D_{\lambda}]) V^{\kappa} \\
 & \quad + (D_{\rho} R_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\kappa} + D_{\nu} R_{\lambda\rho\mu}^{\kappa} + D_{\mu} R_{\lambda\nu\rho}^{\kappa}) V^{\lambda} \quad - (4)
 \end{aligned}$$

In this identity:

$$(T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} [D_{\rho}, D_{\lambda}] + T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} [D_{\nu}, D_{\lambda}] + T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda} [D_{\mu}, D_{\lambda}]) V^{\kappa}$$

$$3) = (T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} R_{\rho\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} R_{\nu\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda} R_{\mu\lambda}^{\kappa}) V^{\kappa} - (T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} T_{\rho\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} T_{\nu\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda} T_{\mu\lambda}^{\kappa}) D_{\lambda} V^{\kappa} \quad - (5)$$

with first Evans identity:

$$T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} T_{\rho\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} T_{\nu\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda} T_{\mu\lambda}^{\kappa} = 0 \quad - (6)$$

So the Jacobi-Cartan Evans identity is:

$$\begin{aligned} & ([D_{\rho}, [D_{\mu}, D_{\nu}]] + [D_{\nu}, [D_{\rho}, D_{\mu}]] + [D_{\mu}, [D_{\nu}, D_{\rho}]]) V^{\kappa} \\ & \quad = (D_{\rho} R_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\kappa} + D_{\nu} R_{\lambda\rho\mu}^{\kappa} + D_{\mu} R_{\lambda\nu\rho}^{\kappa}) V^{\lambda} \\ & \quad + (T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} R_{\rho\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} R_{\nu\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda} R_{\mu\lambda}^{\kappa}) V^{\kappa} \\ & \quad = (D_{\rho} R_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\kappa} + D_{\nu} R_{\lambda\rho\mu}^{\kappa} + D_{\mu} R_{\lambda\nu\rho}^{\kappa} \\ & \quad + T_{\mu\nu}^{\lambda} R_{\rho\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\rho\mu}^{\lambda} R_{\nu\lambda}^{\kappa} + T_{\nu\rho}^{\lambda} R_{\mu\lambda}^{\kappa}) V^{\lambda} \quad - (7) \end{aligned}$$

4) The original 1902 Bianchi identity is:

$$D_\rho R^\kappa_{\mu\nu} + D_\nu R^\kappa_{\rho\mu} + D_\mu R^\kappa_{\nu\rho} = 0 - (8)$$

and this is no longer true in the presence of torsion.

The Jacobi identity (2) gives both the Cartan identity (3) and the first Evans identity (6), as well as the JCF identity (7).
